

City of Gahanna

*200 South Hamilton Road
Gahanna, Ohio 43230*



Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, January 5, 2010

Revised Agenda Organizational & Regular Meeting

6:30 PM

City Hall Committee Rooms

Civil Service Commission

*Paul Leithart, Chairman
David Schroeder, Vice Chair
Katharine Essex
Stephen Renner
Judith Glenn*

Donna L. Jernigan, MMC, Sr. Deputy Clerk of Council

A. CALL TO ORDER - Roll Call.

The Gahanna Civil Service Commission met in Organizational and Regular Session on Tuesday, January 5, 2010, at Gahanna City Hall, 200 South Hamilton Road, Gahanna, Ohio. Mayor Rebecca W. Stinchcomb called the meeting to order at 6:38 p.m. Agenda for this meeting was published on December 30, 2009.

Members Present: Paul Leithart, David Schroeder, Katharine Essex, Stephen Renner and Judith Glenn

ADDITIONAL ATTENDEES:

Mayor Stinchcomb, Isobel Sherwood, Kristen Treadway, Chief Murphy, Bonnie Gard, Matt Huffman.

B. SWEARING IN OF NEWLY APPOINTED COMMISSION MEMBER:

Mayor Stinchcomb gave the oath of office to Judith Glenn and thanked her for being willing to serve.

C. ELECTION OF CHAIRMAN.

Mayor Stinchcomb asked for nominations for Chairman. Schroeder nominated Paul Leithart.

A motion was made to elect Paul Leithart as Chairman. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes 5 Leithart, Schroeder, Essex, Renner and Glenn

D. ELECTION OF VICE CHAIRMAN.

Mayor asked for nominations for Vice Chairman. Leithart nominated Schroeder.

A motion was made to elect Dave Schroeder as Vice Chairman. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes 5 Leithart, Schroeder, Essex, Renner and Glenn

E. ESTABLISH TIME AND DATE OF MEETINGS:

A motion was made by Renner, seconded by Schroeder, to set the first Tuesday of the month at 6:30 p.m. for the date and time of Civil Service Commission meetings for 2010. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes 5 Leithart, Schroeder, Essex, Renner and Glenn

F. ADOPTION OF CIVIL SERVICE RULES OF PROCEDURE DATED AUGUST 8, 2006.

A motion was made by Essex, seconded by Renner, to adopt the Civil Service Rules of Procedure dated August 8, 2006. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes 5 Leithart, Schroeder, Essex, Renner and Glenn

G. ADJOURNMENT OF ORGANIZATIONAL MEETING: 6:43 p.m.**REGULAR MEETING:****1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Newly elected Chairman Paul Leithart called the meeting to order at 6:44 p.m.

Members Present: Paul Leithart, David Schroeder, Katharine Essex, Stephen Renner and Judith Glenn

2. ADDITIONS OR CORRECTIONS TO THE AGENDA

None.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - Regular Meeting December 1, 2009

A motion was made by Renner, seconded by Schroeder, to approve the minutes of the December 1, 2009 Regular Meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes 5 Leithart, Schroeder, Essex, Renner and Glenn

4. HEARING OF VISITORS**5. EXECUTIVE SESSION:****6. UNFINISHED BUSINESS****2009-0047**

Appeal of Performance Appraisal filed by Zoning Administrator, Bonnie Gard; Supervisory Personnel Agreement; filed 11-19-09.

Leithart said at the last meeting we heard the appeal filed by Bonnie Gard and said that we would render a decision on the appeal tonight.

A motion was made by Essex, seconded by Schroeder, to go into Executive Session to discuss personnel. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes 5 Leithart, Schroeder, Essex, Renner and Glenn

The Commission rose to Executive Session at 6:48 p.m. Commission rose from Executive Session at 6:58 p.m. with all members returning to the table.

Leithart said he would address the 4 points that Gard asked the Commission to examine and render a decision on: 1.) The CSC Rules & Regulations do not provide for the CSC to determine the validity of the performance review or to determine actions to determine a "fair" outcome for the employee and reviewer; this is an administrative function; 2.) The CSC Rules do not provide for the CSC to specify a "consistently designated person" to conduct the employee evaluation for the position of Planning & Zoning Administrator or any other position; 3.) Gard pointed out that the forms used had not been formally approved by the CSC; upon review of the form that was used and the form that had been

approved by the CSC, in my judgment, the difference is negligible and constitutes harmless error, because the forms are essentially the same; in addition, at least one appraisal of Gard had been conducted using the same form with no objections to those reviews; 4.) Rule 5.01 is not as clear as it could be regarding to whom the performance review is to be submitted; it appears that the forms are submitted to the HR Department; the lack of clarity in the rule does not render the performance appraisal defective and does not do anything to add to the appeal. Leithart concluded that because of these points I will be voting no.

Essex said she would echo Leithart's comments. Renner said the Commission does not see any prejudice actions; for the record, many people in the Administration speak very highly of you; do not see anything peculiar in the process to impede any action; will also vote no. Schroeder said I concur with Leithart's overview.

A motion was made by Renner, seconded by Essex, to approve the appeal of performance appraisal filed by Bonnie Gard, Zoning Administrator. The motion failed by the following vote:

No	4	Leithart, Schroeder, Essex and Renner
Abstain, COI	1	Glenn
Yes	0	

7. NEW BUSINESS

8. CORRESPONDENCE AND ACTIONS

Sherwood said Council has acknowledged receipt of the Rules & Regulations and they will be the first item on the Finance committee for discussion on January 25th, probably at 7:30 p.m.; in discussion with Kneeland he would like to have some of you there, but do not need you all; will also inform Penn of this meeting with Council. Commission members agreed they wanted to make a united front and will all try to attend; asked clerk to email a reminder. Sherwood said you will be receiving your invitation to the Boards & Commissions appreciation reception which will be held on Jan. 26th here in the committee rooms from 5:30 to 7:00 p.m.

9. OFFICIAL REPORTS

a. Director of Human Resources

2010-0002

Discussion of Fleet Mechanic position.

Treadway said the position was approved in the budget; we did have a Mifflin Township employee in the position for many years; now want to hire someone who is actually a City employee; are working on a process; in state of flux; feel charter takes precedence; not need to give a written test; will be discussing how to proceed with the Director and Superintendent and will come back to Civil Service with a plan at the February meeting. Also, at the February meeting would like to do a presentation of the new on-line application process; is up and running; like to show you how it works. Commission agreed that they would like to see how it works.

b. Chairman

Leithart thanked Commission members for the chance to be chairman.

11. POLL COMMISSION FOR COMMENT

Schroeder asked the student government class attendees to introduce themselves and welcomed them to the meeting.

Essex said she would like to thank the City for the opportunity to go to the employment law seminar; was a good source; did not address civil service issues that we thought it would; still good seminar.

12. ADJOURNMENT: 7:10 p.m.; Motion by Essex.

Donna L. Jernigan, MMC
Senior Deputy Clerk of Council

APPROVED by the Civil Service Commission, this
day of 2010.

Paul Leithart